



HPC Docket # 19-005

Certificate of Appropriateness Emporium Demolition located at 41, 45, 47, 55, 67 N Main Street

REPORT SUMMARY...

<i>Project Name:</i>	Emporium Demolition
<i>Owner/Proponent:</i>	Logan City/Tom Dickinson
<i>Request:</i>	A Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition
<i>Current Zoning:</i>	Town Center – 1 (TC-1)
<i>Staff Recommendation:</i>	Conditionally Approve
<i>Date of Hearing:</i>	November 18, 2019 (UPDATED)
<i>Presented By</i>	Aaron Smith, Planner II

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Committee conditionally approve HPC Docket # 19-005 and issue a Certification of Appropriateness for demolition of the buildings located at 41, 45, 47, 55, and 67 N Main; TIN # 06-025-0011, 06-025-0009, 06-028-0016, 06-028-0015.

PROJECT

The proposal is for the demolition of five (5) buildings located within the Center Street Historic District. All the buildings are owned by Logan City. The proposed demolition is to allow for redevelopment of the site and adjacent Logan City owned property into a public plaza, mixed-use building, and structured parking. Primarily, on the site of the proposed demolition, will be the public plaza, and mixed-use building. The buildings demolition footprint is approximately 174' x 152'. The 174' fronts Main Street.

It is important to note, this Certificate of Appropriateness is for demolition only, and is not the review for a specific project or specific project design. That opportunity and process will follow sometime early next year when the HPC will be evaluating a proposed project & structures for compliance with the Historic District Design Standards. And as will be discussed later in this report, it is important that all interested parties recognize that the Land Development Code clearly delineates the jurisdiction of both the HPC and the Administrator as to their roles in issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of either a Contributory structure versus a Non-Contributory structure. The HPC evaluates Contributory structures and the Administrator evaluates Non-Contributory structures; however, because the buildings are structurally and functionally intertwined, and the anticipated project encompasses the entire site, staff felt it was important that the HPC consider the entire grouping of buildings in their decision making.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Located along historic Main Street and directly west across Main Street from the Logan Tabernacle, the demolition site is located in the historic center of commerce and community in Logan. The buildings vary in year built and historical integrity. Historic Surveys of Logan's Historic District were completed in 1978, 1999 and 2011. Buildings given a rating of either "A" or "B" are considered contributory while those buildings given a rating of either a "C" or "D" are considered noncontributory.

41 N Main

Possibly the most historically significant building slated for demolition, 41 N Main Street was built in 1919 and housed Cardon Jewelry. Cardon Jewelry was started by T. B. Cardon who came to Logan in 1867. The Cardon Jewelry, furniture, and photography business was originally located in 45 N Main. 41 N Main housed the Jewelry store from 1919 to early 1980s. Fred's Flowers occupied the

building in the 1990s. The building is a two-story commercial building. The building has large picture windows on the main floor, large rectangular windows on the second floor, and a heavy cornice supported by double brackets.

In Michael Christensen's *1978 Survey for Historic Homes for Logan City* (1978 Survey), the building is listed as "Contributory" in the preliminary evaluation and the building condition is listed as good and unaltered.

The 1999 Reconnaissance Level Survey (RLS) gives the building a "B" evaluation, meaning the building is considered contributory to the historic district, built within the historic period, but has had alterations.

The 2011 RLS gives the building a "B" evaluation, meaning the building is considered contributory to the historic district. The 2011 Survey describes the architectural style as "Victorian Eclectic."

45 N Main

The original building at 45 N Main was built in 1881 and was the first three story building in the city. As with 41 N Main, the original building was built by T. B. Cardon. While housing Mr. Cardon's business enterprises for a time, the building was also leased to various businesses, including a general store and a clothing store in the late 19th and early 20th century. Local directories show that the Logan Hardware Store occupied the building from at least 1929 to 1979. Bennett's Glass and Paint occupied the building during the 80s and 90s. By the time of the historic district survey in 1978, the front façade had been sheathed in aluminum. In 1997, the façade and building were extensively renovated. The renovation of the façade produced a facsimile of the original building façade and detailing. The renovation included office and banquet space. The building was renamed Plaza 45.

In the 1978 Survey the building is listed as "Contributory" in the preliminary evaluation and the building condition is listed as good with minor alterations. The 1978 survey commented on a handsome façade that could be seen under the aluminum.

The 1999 RLS gives the building a "B" evaluation, meaning the building is considered contributory to the historic district, built within the historic period, but has had alterations. The comments on the survey include that the building was reconstructed in 1997 and that it had been de-listed from the National Register.

The 2011 RLS gives the building a "C" evaluation, meaning the building was built during the historic period but has had major alterations or additions and no longer retains historic integrity.

47 N Main

Built in 1898, this building was originally a harness and saddle shop. Later the building became a jewelry store. Baugh Jewelry occupied the building from at least 1947 to 1977. The 1978 survey noted that the façade was clad in aluminum. In 1984 the aluminum was removed and stucco was applied to the facade. In 1998, a façade grant was given for material repairs.

In the 1978 Survey the building is listed as "Contributory" in the preliminary evaluation and the building condition is listed as good with minor alterations.

The 1999 RLS gives the building a "C" evaluation. Noted in the survey is the 1984 stucco.

The 2011 RLS gives the building a "C" evaluation.

55 N Main

The Emporium building was constructed in 1977. The Emporium replaced the old JC Penny department store that occupied the location from at least 1946. Originally, the site had consisted of at least two building, F.W Woolsowrth at 51 N Main, and JC Penny at 59 N Main. All of these locations were conglomerated into JC Penny and later the Emporium. The Emporium remodel consisted of a complete façade redesign and gutting of the interior to allow for a mini-mall of about 20 stores.

In the 1978 Survey the building is listed as “Not Contributory” in the preliminary evaluation and the building condition is listed as excellent with major alterations.

The 1999 RLS gives the building a “D” evaluation, meaning that the building was constructed outside the historic period and is not considered contributory.

The 2011 RLS gives the building a “D” evaluation.

67 N Main

The other building on the demolition list that retains much of its historical integrity, 67 N Main was built in 1890 for the City Drug Company. The City Drug Store occupied the building until 1955. During the 1950s, 60s, and 70s, Gallenkamps Shoes occupied the space. The two-story building features large picture windows on the first floor, and large rectangular windows on the second floor. The 1978 Survey notes that the building originally featured a Greek temple-like gable, but that detail had since been removed.

In the 1978 Survey the building is listed as “Contributory” in the preliminary evaluation and the building condition is listed as good an unaltered.

The 1999 RLS gives the building a “B” evaluation.

The 2011 RLS gives the building a “B” evaluation.

DEMOLITION AND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

The Demolition of contributory buildings in the Center Street Historic District are required to obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Historic Preservation Committee (LDC 17.20.050.A.2). For this project, 41 N and 67 N Main are considered Contributory based on their survey evaluations. Non-Contributory structures, e.g., 45 N, 47 N, and 55 N Main, are considered Non-Contributory based on their survey evaluations, and are required to obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Director (LDC 17.20.050.B.2). Because the buildings are internally and structurally interconnected, staff felt that it would be appropriate for the HPC to review and consider the Certificate of Appropriateness for all buildings at the same time. Furthermore, the application for demolition shall be accompanied by a plan for proposed new construction on the site.

The City acquired the site (41, 45, 55 and 67) in May 9, 2016 with subsequent acquisition of 47 N Main occurring in April 1, 2019. The initial reasons behind acquiring these buildings were that the City was seriously considering relocating the library to this location and/or site, and that the City was concerned with focused redevelopment of this downtown block to stimulate new life into the broader downtown. Any plans for redevelopment of this block, it was determined, had to include some type of public gathering space, whether externally such as a plaza, or internally within a public library. The City evaluated the building and the site for a new library and concluded that functionally and structurally, the collection of buildings was inadequate to house both a modern library and public gathering space. The concept of placing the library shifted from this site elsewhere and the focus emphasized revitalization of the Center Block through a combination of uses, including residential, public gathering areas, varying types of commercial uses, and structured parking. The City has been working with a private developer to prepare redevelopment plans for Center Block. This developer

was chosen through a public Request for Proposal (RFP) process and has lengthy experience in the redevelopment of downtown areas, both historic and non-historic, with a variety of housing and commercial uses. The concept plan which will replace the existing collection of buildings (41 – 67) includes a public gathering element, a commercial element, a residential element, and a structured parking element, all of which will help to stimulate new life in the historic core of Logan.

Logan City's goal for downtown is to create a downtown that is vibrant and acts as a community center. The Downtown Logan Specific Plan, adopted in 2012, outlines several specific goals for the downtown, including economic development and revitalization, new residential development, additional parking, and new public and community gathering spaces. The proposed project at the Emporium site will help to achieve several of those goals, including the creation of community gathering spaces, mixed-use and housing development, and terraced parking.

A Certification of Appropriateness for demolition shall meet the following standards:

1. The historic resource is in such a deteriorated condition that it is not feasible to preserve or restore.

Three of the five buildings are no longer considered contributory to the historic district because of extensive remodels and construction over the previous decades. The other two buildings (41 N and 67 N) are so integrated into the larger Emporium complex (structural, HVAC, access, plumbing, electrical, etc.) that they are no longer structurally sound nor structurally independent. Any project of relevance would require a complete removal of the buildings and reconstruction of facades which would negate the historic values trying to be preserved.

2. The physical integrity of the resource is no longer evident.

The scope of the buildings being considered for demolition was determined based on the interconnectivity of the 5 structures. Extensive interior remodels have created connected spaces, shared utilities and structural components between all the buildings. For the purposes of this project, it was simply not feasible to economically salvage any of the buildings. The various remodels have had a significant impact on the interiors of the historic buildings at 41 N and 67 N Main as well as the others. While a portion of the main floor in both 41 N and 67 N retain some historical detailing, additions and remodels over the year have reduced much of the historical character of the spaces.

3. The demolition would not adversely affect the Historic District due to the surrounding noncontributing structures.

As mentioned already, three of the structures to be removed are noncontributing structures. This block has seen a wide scope of change since Logan City was incorporated and the downtown was formed. Changing trends in building design, building materials, construction practices, purchasing and shopping habits along with the fact that the City and valley have grown significantly, commercial activity has spread beyond the historic downtown, the importance of the automobile, and even significant natural events such as earthquakes and fires have significantly altered downtown. The broader goal of this effort is to focus on the core block in downtown Logan as one of the first steps in revitalizing the broader downtown area thereby preserving the history of downtown Logan as it relates to the context of the broader Cache Valley.

4. The plan for new construction would be consistent with applicable city goals and objectives.

The primary focus of Logan's Downtown Specific Plan is to bring new economic and commercial development, and cultural vitality into the downtown area through enhanced residential and

commercial, and through the addition of new community gathering spaces. The proposed project at the Emporium site will help to achieve several of those goals.

5. The denial for demolition would cause an “economic hardship”.

Logan City has invested several millions of taxpayer dollars into the Emporium building site with the explicit goals of revitalizing downtown and creating a new sense of community pride. Logan’s downtown was once the center of Cache Valley, and this project is trying to re-introduce that concept back into the discussion. The City wants people to come back into the downtown to live, work, shop and play. Failing to move forward with big changes on this block, and instead defaulting to the “status quo”, is an economic hardship on the entire downtown community.

6. The option for public or private acquisition has been sought out and is not feasible.

Logan City purchased the properties when we determined that the best recourse for this site was to completely rethink status quo. Small retail or restaurant space would not thrive in a re-opened or re-vamped Emporium, nor would it create significant public gathering spaces benefiting all segments of our population.

7. Economic incentives to avoid the demolition are not available.

Economic incentives are being used to construct a public plaza, public ice rink, structured parking and other elements of the overall project. Public economic incentives are not available to “remodel” the Emporium building complex.

8. The building proposed for demolition is no longer considered historically significant due to a variety of factors such as incompatible or historically inaccurate additions, renovations, modifications, etc.

Three of the five buildings are no longer considered historically significant. The scope of the buildings being considered for demolition was determined based on the interconnectivity of the five structures. Extensive interior remodels have created connected spaces, shared utilities and structural components between all the buildings. For the purposes of this project, it was simply not feasible to economically salvage any of the buildings. The various remodels have had a significant impact on the interiors of the historic buildings at 41 N and 67 N Main. While a portion of the main floor in each building retains some historical detailing, additions and remodels over the year have reduced much of the historical character of the spaces.

Logan City has provided a historic record that includes a history of the structures, photographs of the interior and exterior of the structures including documentation of the building’s architectural details, and floor plans with this report.

SUMMARY

The decision to fundamentally alter the historic frontage of one the most prominent section of Logan’s downtown is a consequential consideration for the HPC. The proposed redevelopment will alter the existing character of the district; however, the proposed replacement will significantly enhance the overall downtown area. Staff’s review of the project finds that the demolition and proposed redevelopment of the site is consistent with the overall goals for Logan’s downtown as specified in the Downtown Logan Specific Plan. While most of the buildings proposed for demolition (45 N, 47 N, 55 N) are not considered contributory to the district, both 41 N and 67 N are considered contributory to the district. The extensive interconnected nature of both 41 N and 67 N to the surrounding noncontributory buildings does not make it feasible for them to be preserve. Overall, this project will

revitalize a section of downtown by providing a variety of uses that will support adjacent economic activity and promote a vibrant downtown.

PUBLIC NOTICE

Public Notice letters were sent to adjacent property owners with a 300-foot radius of the property on 9/17/19 and the legal notice was published in the Herald Journal on 9/21/19.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Any public comments received have been forwarded to the HPC.

RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

This project is subject to the proponent or property owner agreeing to comply with the following conditions as written, or as may be amended by the Historic Preservation Committee.

1. Any representations by the proponent at the Historic Preservation Committee hearing that is approved shall be incorporated into the final action as conditions of approval and recorded on the Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. The Historic Preservation Committee approves the demolition of 41, 45, 47, 55, 67 N Main street buildings.
3. The proponent is responsible to ensure that any demolition is appropriately permitted and inspected by the Building Safety Division through timely scheduled inspections.
4. The proponent shall provide a Historic Record Report to the Community Development Department that encompasses the project site, with attention to the 41 N Main and 67 N Main buildings, which are considered contributory to the historic district.
5. Failure to comply with any conditions of approval shall void the permit and require a new Historic Preservation Committee hearing.

RECOMMENDED FINDINGS FOR APPROVAL

The Historic Preservation Committee bases its decisions on the following findings supported in the administrative record for this project:

1. The project complies with all requirements imposed by Title 17 of the Logan Municipal Code.
2. Two buildings (41 N & 67 N) are considered a "B" evaluation in the 2011 Reconnaissance Level Survey, and considered contributory to the Historic District. Three of the buildings (45 N, 47 N & 55 N) are considered noncontributory to the Historic District.
3. The project meets the stated goals for development in the Logan Downtown Specific Plan.
4. The interconnected nature and structural issues of the contributory buildings do not allow for alternative uses of the buildings.
5. The project substantially complies with demolition standards outlined in the *Center Street Historic District Design Standards*.

This staff report is an analysis of the application based on adopted city documents, standard city development practices, and available information. The report is to be used to review and consider the merits of the application prior to and during the course of the Historic Preservation Committee meeting. Additional information may be revealed by participants at the Historic Preservation Committee meeting which may modify the staff report and become the Certificate of Decision. The Director of Community Development reserves the right to supplement the material in the report with additional information at the Historic Preservation Committee meeting.